

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:19-cv-01835-DLC**

American Immigration Council et al v. Executive Office For  
Immigration Review et al  
Assigned to: Judge Denise L. Cote  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 02/27/2019  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of  
Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration  
Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N.  
Cardozo School of Law**

represented by **Kristin Macleod-Ball**  
American Immigration Council  
1318 Beacon Street  
Suite 18  
Brookline, MA 02446  
857-305-3722  
Email: [kmacleod-ball@immcouncil.org](mailto:kmacleod-ball@immcouncil.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Trina A. Realmuto**  
American Immigration Council  
1318 Beacon Street  
Suite 18  
Brookline, MA 02446  
857-305-3600  
Fax: 202-742-5619  
Email: [trealmuto@immcouncil.org](mailto:trealmuto@immcouncil.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Lindsay Cotten Nash**  
Cardozo Immigration Justice Clinic  
55 Fifth Avenue  
New York, NY 10003  
212-790-0433  
Fax: 212-790-0256  
Email: [lindsay.nash@yu.edu](mailto:lindsay.nash@yu.edu)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**American Immigration Council**

represented by **Lindsay Cotten Nash**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Claudia Valenzuela**  
American Immigration Council  
1331 G Street NW  
Ste 200  
Washington, DC 20005  
202-507-7540  
Fax: 202-742-5619  
Email: [cvalenzuela@immcouncil.org](mailto:cvalenzuela@immcouncil.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Kristin Macleod-Ball**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Trina A. Realmuto**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant**

**Executive Office For Immigration  
Review**

represented by **Joshua Evan Kahane**  
U.S. Attorney Office SDNY  
86 Chambers Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212-637-2699  
Email: [joshua.kahane@usdoj.gov](mailto:joshua.kahane@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Defendant**

**U.S. Department of Justice**

represented by **Joshua Evan Kahane**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
02/27/2019	<u>1</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – FILED AGAINST PARTY AND FILER ERROR</b> – COMPLAINT against Department Of Justice, Executive Office For Immigration Review. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number ANYSDC-16415697) Document filed by Immigration Justice Clinic of The Benjamin N. Cardozo School Of Law, American Immigration Council. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Ex. A–First Request, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex. B–First Request Receipt Notice, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex. C–First Request Response Letter, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Ex. D–First Request Response Appeal, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Ex. E–First Request Appeal Decision, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Ex. F–Second Request, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Ex. G–Second Request Receipt Notice)(Nash, Lindsay) Modified on 2/28/2019 (jgo). (Entered: 02/27/2019)
02/27/2019	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 02/27/2019)
02/27/2019	<u>3</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by American Immigration Council, Immigration Justice Clinic of The Benjamin N. Cardozo School Of Law.(Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 02/27/2019)
02/28/2019		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING PARTY MODIFICATION. Notice to attorney Lindsay Cotten Nash. The party information for the following party/parties has been modified: Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law; U.S. Department of Justice. The information for the party/parties has been modified for the following reason/reasons: party name contained a typographical error;. (jgo) (Entered: 02/28/2019)</b>
02/28/2019		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT PLEADING. Notice to Attorney Lindsay Cotten Nash to RE–FILE Document No. <u>1</u> Complaint. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): due to party modification, the wrong filer/filers were selected for the pleading; due to party modification, the wrong party/parties whom the pleading is against were selected;. Re–file the pleading using the event type Complaint found under the event list Complaints and Other Initiating Documents – attach the correct signed PDF – select the individually named filer/filers – select the individually named party/parties the pleading is against. (jgo) (Entered: 02/28/2019)</b>
02/28/2019		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge Denise L. Cote. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District</a> . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php</a> . (jgo) (Entered: 02/28/2019)

02/28/2019		Magistrate Judge Robert W. Lehrburger is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php</a> . (jgo) (Entered: 02/28/2019)
02/28/2019		Case Designated ECF. (jgo) (Entered: 02/28/2019)
02/28/2019	<u>4</u>	COMPLAINT against Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. Document filed by Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law, American Immigration Council. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Ex. A– First Request, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex. B– First Request Receipt Notice, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex. C– First Request Response Letter, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Ex. D– First Request Response Appeal, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Ex. E– First Request Appeal Decision, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Ex. F– Second Request, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Ex. G– Second Request Receipt Notice)(Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 02/28/2019)
03/05/2019	<u>5</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Department of Justice, re: <u>4</u> Complaint,,. Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 03/05/2019)
03/05/2019	<u>6</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Executive Office for Immigration Review, re: <u>4</u> Complaint,,. Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 03/05/2019)
03/05/2019	<u>7</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear as Law Students . Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Ex. A – Ben Tov Appearance Form, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex. B – Bukh Appearance Form, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex. C – Castillo Appearance Form, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Ex. D – Lundgren Appearance Form)(Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 03/05/2019)
03/06/2019	<u>8</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Executive Office For Immigration Review. (sj) (Entered: 03/06/2019)
03/06/2019	<u>9</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Department of Justice. (sj) (Entered: 03/06/2019)
03/11/2019	<u>10</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Joshua Evan Kahane on behalf of Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 03/11/2019)
03/11/2019	<u>11</u>	ORDER granting <u>7</u> Motion for Leave to Appear As Law Students. (Signed by Judge Denise L. Cote on 3/11/2019) (gr) (Entered: 03/11/2019)
03/11/2019	<u>12</u>	NOTICE OF INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE (Notice) Initial Conference set for 5/10/2019 at 02:30 PM in Courtroom 18B, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Denise L. Cote. (Please follow the procedures set forth in the Notice.) (Signed by Judge Denise L. Cote on 3/11/2019) (gr) (Entered: 03/11/2019)
03/28/2019	<u>13</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY</b> – MOTION for Claudia Valenzuela to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC–16580863. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by American Immigration Council. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supplement IL Letter of Good Standing)(Valenzuela, Claudia) Modified on 3/28/2019 (ma). (Entered: 03/28/2019)
03/28/2019		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING DEFICIENT MOTION TO APPEAR PRO HAC VICE. Notice to RE–FILE Document No. <u>13</u> MOTION for Claudia Valenzuela to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC–16580863. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): missing certificate of good standing from the Supreme Court of Illinois, affidavit pursuant to local rule 1.3. and proposed order. Re–file the motion as a Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice – attach the correct signed PDF – select the correct named filer/filers – attach valid Certificates of Good Standing issued within the past 30 days – attach Proposed</b>

		<b>Order.. (ma)</b> (Entered: 03/28/2019)
04/08/2019	<u>14</u>	MOTION for Claudia Valenzuela to Appear Pro Hac Vice . <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by American Immigration Council. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit, # <u>2</u> Supplement IL SCT Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>3</u> Proposed Order)(Valenzuela, Claudia) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/08/2019		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>14</u> MOTION for Claudia Valenzuela to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (wb)</b> (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/08/2019	<u>15</u>	ANSWER to <u>4</u> Complaint,, Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice.(Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/09/2019	<u>16</u>	ORDER granting <u>14</u> Motion for Claudia Valenzuela to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Denise L. Cote)(Text Only Order) (gr) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/09/2019	<u>17</u>	ORDER: ORDERED that the May 10, 2019 initial pretrial conference is rescheduled to May 9 at 2 p.m. in Courtroom 18B, 500 Pearl Street. (Signed by Judge Denise L. Cote on 4/9/2019) (gr) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/16/2019	<u>18</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of summonses, complaint, ECF Filing Rules, Judge Cote's Individual Rules served on Geoffrey S. Berman, U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of New York on 03/21/2019. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Summonses, # <u>2</u> Complaint, # <u>3</u> ECF Filing Rules, # <u>4</u> Judge Cote's Individual Rules)(Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 04/16/2019)
04/16/2019	<u>19</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED. U.S. Department of Justice served on 3/22/2019, answer due 4/12/2019. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law; American Immigration Council. (Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 04/16/2019)
04/16/2019	<u>20</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED. Executive Office For Immigration Review served on 3/21/2019, answer due 4/11/2019. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law; American Immigration Council. (Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 04/16/2019)
04/17/2019	<u>21</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Kristin Macleod-Ball on behalf of American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Macleod-Ball, Kristin) (Entered: 04/17/2019)
04/18/2019	<u>22</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Trina A. Realmuto on behalf of American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Realmuto, Trina) (Entered: 04/18/2019)
05/09/2019	<u>23</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Judge Cote's Individual Rules and Provided Notice of Initial Pretrial Conference served on Geoffrey S. Berman, U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of New York on 03/21/2019. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 05/09/2019)
05/09/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Denise L. Cote: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 5/9/2019. (gr) (Entered: 05/09/2019)
05/09/2019	<u>24</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Denise L. Cote from Lindsay Nash dated 05/09/2019 re: Initial Pretrial Conference. Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Nash, Lindsay) (Entered: 05/09/2019)
05/09/2019	<u>25</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Denise L. Cote from Joshua Kahane dated 5/9/19 re: Initial Pretrial Conference. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A Proposed Briefing

		Schedule Letter)(Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 05/09/2019)
05/09/2019	<u>26</u>	ORDER: As set forth at the pretrial conference held pursuant to Rule 16, Fed. R. Civ. P., on May 9, 2019, it is hereby ORDERED that the parties shall submit a status letter to the Court by June 7, 2019. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the defendants motion for summary judgment is due by July 19, 2019, the plaintiffs opposition is due by August 9, 2019, and any reply by the defendants is due by August 30, 2019. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the plaintiffs cross-motion for summary judgment is due by August 9, 2019, the defendants opposition is due by August 30, 2019, and any reply by the plaintiffs is due by September 13, 2019. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that at the time any reply is filed, the moving party shall supply Chambers with two (2) courtesy copies of all motion papers by mailing or delivering them to the United States Courthouse, 500 Pearl Street, New York, New York. (Signed by Judge Denise L. Cote on 5/9/2019) (gr) (Entered: 05/09/2019)
05/16/2019		Civil Case Opening Fee Refunded: for <u>1</u> Complaint. Filing fee refunded for Receipt number ANYSDC-16415591, for the following reason(s): duplicate payment. (jom) (Entered: 05/30/2019)
06/07/2019	<u>27</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Denise L. Cote from Joshua Kahane dated 6/7/19 re: Status Letter. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice.(Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 06/07/2019)
07/12/2019	<u>28</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages addressed to Judge Denise L. Cote from Joshua Kahane dated 7/12/19. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice.(Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 07/12/2019)
07/12/2019	<u>29</u>	ORDER granting <u>28</u> Government's Letter Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. (Signed by Judge Denise L. Cote on 7/12/2019) (gr) (Entered: 07/12/2019)
07/19/2019	<u>30</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice.(Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 07/19/2019)
07/19/2019	<u>31</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 07/19/2019)
07/19/2019	<u>32</u>	DECLARATION of Donna Carr in Support re: <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 07/19/2019)
07/19/2019	<u>33</u>	DECLARATION of Christopher J. Gearin in Support re: <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Ex. A)(Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 07/19/2019)
07/19/2019	<u>34</u>	DECLARATION of Brett Endres in Support re: <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 07/19/2019)
07/19/2019	<u>35</u>	DECLARATION of Joseph R. Schaaf in Support re: <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Ex. A, # <u>2</u> Ex. B, # <u>3</u> Ex. C, # <u>4</u> Ex. D, # <u>5</u> Ex. E, # <u>6</u> Ex. F, # <u>7</u> Ex. G, # <u>8</u> Ex. H, # <u>9</u> Ex. I, # <u>10</u> Ex. J, # <u>11</u> Ex. K, # <u>12</u> Ex. L, # <u>13</u> Ex. M, # <u>14</u> Ex. N, # <u>15</u> Ex. O, # <u>16</u> Ex. P, # <u>17</u> Ex. Q, # <u>18</u> Ex. R, # <u>19</u> Ex. S, # <u>20</u> Ex. T, # <u>21</u> Ex. U, # <u>22</u> Ex. V)(Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 07/19/2019)
07/19/2019	<u>36</u>	DECLARATION of Crystal R. Souza in Support re: <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 07/19/2019)
08/07/2019	<u>37</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment/Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment addressed to Judge Denise L. Cote from Claudia Valenzuela dated 8/7/2019. Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law.(Valenzuela, Claudia) (Entered: 08/07/2019)

08/07/2019	<u>38</u>	ORDER granting <u>37</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Cross–Motion for Summary Judgment/Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment. Extension to August 14 is granted. The date of Sept. 5 and 18 are approved. Cross Motions due by 8/14/2019. (Signed by Judge Denise L. Cote on 8/7/2019) (jca) (Entered: 08/07/2019)
08/07/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 9/5/2019, Replies due by 9/18/2019. (jca) (Entered: 08/07/2019)
08/14/2019	<u>39</u>	CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i> . Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. Responses due by 9/5/2019(Macleod–Ball, Kristin) (Entered: 08/14/2019)
08/14/2019	<u>40</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>39</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i> . . Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Macleod–Ball, Kristin) (Entered: 08/14/2019)
08/14/2019	<u>41</u>	DECLARATION of Lindsay Nash in Support re: <u>39</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i> .. Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Macleod–Ball, Kristin) (Entered: 08/14/2019)
08/15/2019	<u>42</u>	RESPONSE in Support of Motion re: <u>39</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i> . <i>Statement of Undisputed Facts</i> . Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Macleod–Ball, Kristin) (Entered: 08/15/2019)
08/15/2019	<u>43</u>	DECLARATION of Kristin Macleod–Ball in Support re: <u>39</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i> .. Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exh. A, # <u>2</u> Exh. B, # <u>3</u> Exh. C, # <u>4</u> Exh. D, # <u>5</u> Exh. E, # <u>6</u> Exh. F, # <u>7</u> Exh. G, # <u>8</u> Exh. I, # <u>9</u> Exh. J, # <u>10</u> Exh. K, # <u>11</u> Exh. L, # <u>12</u> Exh. M)(Macleod–Ball, Kristin) (Entered: 08/15/2019)
08/15/2019	<u>44</u>	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Exhibits and Statement of Undisputed Material Facts <i>in support of Plaintiffs' Cross–Motion for Summary Judgment and Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i> addressed to Judge Denise L. Cote from Kristin Macleod–Ball dated 8/15/2019. Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Decl. of Kristin Macled–Ball, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exh. A to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>3</u> Exhibit Exh. B to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>4</u> Exhibit Exh. C to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>5</u> Exhibit Exh. D to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>6</u> Exhibit Exh. E to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>7</u> Exhibit Exh. F to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>8</u> Exhibit Exh. G to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>9</u> Exhibit Exh. H to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>10</u> Exhibit Exh. I to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>11</u> Exhibit Exh. J to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>12</u> Exhibit Exh. K to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>13</u> Exhibit Exh. L to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>14</u> Exhibit Exh. M to Macleod–Ball Decl., # <u>15</u> Exhibit Statement of Undisputed Material Facts)(Macleod–Ball, Kristin) (Entered: 08/15/2019)
08/15/2019	<u>45</u>	ORDER granting <u>44</u> LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Exhibits and Statement of Undisputed Material Facts in support of Plaintiffs' Cross–Motion for Summary Judgment and Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment. Granted. (Signed by Judge Denise L. Cote on 8/15/2019) (jca) (Entered: 08/15/2019)
09/03/2019	<u>46</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply addressed to Judge Denise L. Cote from Joshua Kahane dated 9/3/19. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice.(Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 09/03/2019)
09/03/2019	<u>47</u>	ORDER granting <u>46</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply Government's response due by 9/9/2019. Plaintiffs' reply due by 9/23/2019. (Signed by Judge Denise L. Cote on 9/3/2019) (gr) (Entered: 09/03/2019)

09/09/2019	<u>48</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . <i>and in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Cross–Motion for Summary Judgment.</i> Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 09/09/2019)
09/09/2019	<u>49</u>	DECLARATION of David Fruehwald (Supplemental) in Support re: <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 09/09/2019)
09/09/2019	<u>50</u>	DECLARATION of Joseph R. Schaaf (Supplemental) in Support re: <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Executive Office For Immigration Review, U.S. Department of Justice. (Kahane, Joshua) (Entered: 09/09/2019)
09/23/2019	<u>51</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>39</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment.</i> . Document filed by American Immigration Council, Kathryn O. Greenberg Immigration Justice Clinic at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. (Macleod–Ball, Kristin) (Entered: 09/23/2019)